



**Regional Project for Cultural Heritage and Development  
UNDP/UNESCO**

**RLA/83/002**

**EXTERNAL EVALUATION MISSION  
FINAL REPORT**

Feb. 1989



Regional Project for Cultural Heritage and Development

UNDP/UNESCO

RLA/83/002

**EXTERNAL EVALUATION MISSION**

**FINAL REPORT**

Feb. 1989

REGIONAL PROJECT FOR CULTURAL HERITAGE AND DEVELOPMENT  
UNDP/UNESCO  
RLA/83/002

EXTERNAL EVALUATION MISSION  
FINAL REPORT  
Feb. 1989

This report has been submitted by: Peter Koenz, Chief of Mission  
Gerard Bolla  
Paulo de Azevedo

PRESERVATION OF THE CULTURAL HERITAGE IN LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

RLAC/83/002

REPORT OF THE 1988 EXTERNAL EVALUATION MISSION

February 28, 1989

TABLE OF CONTENTS

|  | <u>Page</u> | <u>No</u> |
|--|-------------|-----------|
| I. SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS | 1           | - 3       |
| II. PROJECT CONCEPT AND DESIGN             | 4           | - 16      |
| III. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION                | 16          | - 37      |
| IV. RESULTS AND FOLLOW-UP PERSPECTIVES     | 38          | - 49      |
| V. FOLLOW-UP AND SUSTAINABILITY (pro mem.) |             | 49        |
| VI. LESSONS LEARNED                        | 50          | - 52      |
| VII. FINDINGS                              | 52          | - 54      |
| VIII. RECOMMENDATIONS                      | 54          | - 59      |

## CONCLUSIONS, OBSERVATIONS

### I. SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS AND RECOMMENDATION

#### 1. CONCLUSIONS

##### Findings:

The project has been successful in terms of relevance, impact and multiplier effect, management and implementation rates; specifically; *in this last phase (92-94) as seen as in the past* the following are salient results; *cost-effectiveness*

- (i) project action has encompassed a wide variety of subjects corresponding to felt needs in the region, while maintaining overall conceptual consistency; it has innovated and assisted in the emergence of new ideas and policies, most notably regarding the integration of cultural values in social and economic development *in the urban context and Sustainable Human Development programmes in the Maya World Region.*
- (ii) instead of creating a central institutional infrastructure the project has operated in a decentralized manner, relying upon and wherever appropriate building up national institutions; *to this effect*
- (iii) the project has served as a catalyst to mobilize very substantial additional resources from a variety of national and international, governmental and non-governmental sources *including the private sector*
- (iv) emphasis has been placed on human resource development; training and ~~colloquia~~ *workshops* have been used also to develop new policy concepts and set the basis for institutional development and operational action;

A sound network of national conservation centers has been consolidated with almost 15 centres of excellence ~~with~~ each with a certain type of regional vocation.

- (v) the project has been most effective in stimulating South-South cooperation not only within the region, but also with other continents;
- (vi) the project field staff has operated with considerable autonomy; ~~nevertheless~~ <sup>R</sup> relations between UNESCO's normative and policy functions and the <sup>P</sup> project have been mutually beneficial;
- (vii) compared to its ambitious objectives <sup>and achievement</sup> project funding has been very modest, with annual allocations declining over the ~~cycle~~ <sup>from the Regional IPF extremes</sup>; there is some danger that the level of the core resources might fall below the threshold needed to sustain its catalytic, coordination and central funding role.

2. Recommendations:

- (i) UNDP funding for the remaining years of the project may have to be strengthened to enable it to play the essential central role in attaining the objectives defined in Revision G, and preparing follow-up action beyond 1991;
- (ii) UNDP should be prepared to maintain its regional support after 1991, with a CTA stationed in the field, even though national institutions and networks of national institutions, would assume the main responsibility for policy formulation and operational action;

three year period - with a substantial  
input from UNESCO for running costs and  
the part of CTA at secretariat staff ...-lin/abr  
(see  
enclosure)



- (iii) in any event, project activities in the remaining years of the cycle should be used to set the basis for follow-up action which might be considered in early 1991 by a round-table meeting with national institutions and external funding agencies involved (or interested) in the project;
- (iv) in the remaining years of the project deliberate efforts should be made to strengthen and interlink national and sub-regional institutions capable of operating with a high degree of autonomy; to this end, scientific and technical information systems will be of the essence, as well as joint or synchronized research efforts throughout the region; a realistic time-table should be proposed;
- (v) as regards substantive areas, continued emphasis should be placed on the interface human/natural patrimony, as well as on the integration of cultural values and assets in urban development; increased attention should be given to special topics such as rescue-, underwater and industrial archaeology, as well as to the preservation of particularly vulnerable materials (e.g. paper, films, tape); it may be assumed that these priorities will figure prominently also action after 1991;
- (vi) in order to disseminate its results, and as a contribution to improved information exchanges within the region, the project should consider publishing a bi-monthly bulletin.

RLA 91/029

- 4 -

RLA 83/002 and

## II. PROJECT CONCEPT AND DESIGN

Time frame: continuity

February 95

3. By ~~end 1991~~, when the ~~current~~ <sup>P</sup> project is due to terminate, UNDP support for regional action related to cultural heritage and development in Latin America and the Caribbean will have been in operation for almost two decades.<sup>(1)</sup> This may represent an unusually long time-span for a traditional technical assistance project, but seems justified if one considers the fact that the geographic reach of RLA/83/002 and its precursor projects RLA/72/047 and 76/002 has grown from 6<sup>(1)</sup> to 30 countries, ~~that~~ its conceptual scope continued to expand, generating and adjusting to new demands, and that the basic function of the UNDP support was --and remains-- to stimulate and interlink national and sub-regional action which is often --though by no means always-- the object of national or interregional UNDP projects (see list in Annex H hereto). It ~~was thus said,~~ <sup>can be</sup> in the course of our inquiries, that RLA/83/002 had become the principal matrix --or sounding board-- for new cultural heritage and human settlement concepts, policies and technological approaches throughout the region. It was also stressed that this function was to a large extent contingent upon the flexible, informal, non-institutionalized modus operandi of a UNDP project open to co-

has been

(1) In fact, project operations started only in 1976; at that time the project had a narrow Andean focus.

and the environment

human

management/development

and

operation with a variety of inter-governmental and non-governmental bodies concerned with the cultural patrimony, natural resources, urban planning and socio-economic development. Thanks to this, and to its ability to mobilize support and resources around the themes it proposed, the project played a co-ordinating and central funding role consistent with UNDP's concern with the overall management of development.

- 4. The conceptual approach and modus operandi of the project will be discussed in further detail elsewhere in this report. We considered it important, however, to answer at the outset any doubts which might be voiced due to the fact that UN regional involvement with the cultural heritage had been in operation for over fifteen years. A different time frame would not have done justice to the subject-matter of the project, nor to the fact that attitudes and policies regarding the cultural patrimony in the context of development have been evolving steadily but slowly. In retrospect, it is evident that the continuity of UNDP support has been of critical importance in this process. This is also a direct consequence of the participatory, from-the-ground-up approach in which the ultimate objective is the development of autonomous and self-supporting action at national and community level, interlinked by a pattern of co-operation among equal partners.

from document //

bottom

X WHC

*Factoid*

Direct and Indirect Project Impact

5. Indeed, another characteristic which must be kept in mind in assessing the regional project, in its successive versions, is that it was intended to play, and has in fact played a role which was above all that of a catalyst. Compared to the national policy commitments and the very considerable resources it has helped to mobilize throughout the region --much in excess of the counterpart contributions listed in the project document-- UNDP funding and the institutional supra-structure it supports have been quite modest (in essence, a highly mobile and creative Chief Technical Adviser, some supporting staff, and some funds for travel, consultants, training and equipment). It is thus evident that RLA/83/002 has had a remarkable multiplier effect --a fact which must figure prominently in the overall assessment of the project. On the other hand, this aspect makes it difficult to apply a linear evaluation model, in that the ultimate impact, especially in terms of the project's development objectives, does not always follow a direct pattern, but most generally be discerned in action external to the project, though attributable to or at least stimulated by it.
6. Given the great variety of activities to which the project relates, our evaluation will thus consist of a series of relatively broad, generic considerations derived from exchanges of views with the CTA, in-house and external project staff and some counterpart institutions, the analysis of project records

*con.*

as well as the deliberations of the consultative group convened during our visit to Lima. Our report also contains quantitative data relating to inputs, delivery and outputs. The actual impact, on the other hand, could only be verified by direct observation of a limited --though representative--sample of project-related activities (Annexes B and C, and para. 12 below).

### Conceptual Orientation

7. The general orientation and philosophy under which RLA/83/002 operates is clearly defined in Revision G of the project, even if the language of that document is bureaucratically dense. We were able to verify not only that it reflected the conceptual framework of the project itself, but that it conformed to the views on cultural heritage and development emerging among policy-makers and scholars in the region.
8. In essence, the conceptual approach that underlies ~~Revision~~ Revision G, with its three types of objectives (conservation and management; cultural dimension of development; South-South co-operation) signifies a broad, integrated view of culture and cultural heritage. The main focus is no longer on preservation or conservation per se of particular objects or monuments, but on understanding and enhancing their role in the context of their environment. While object-centered efforts --especially training-- continue in the region as part of the project and independently of it, training institutions of a purely (or pre-

qu

dominantly) technical nature (e.g. Churubusco and Cuzco)<sup>(2)</sup> have lost much of their relevance and vitality. Throughout the region cultural heritage is now gradually being seen as an integral part of development, political as well as social and economic. Particular attention is thus given to the preservation of cultural assets --including sites, historic centres and museums-- in a live context, i.e. above all their integration in processes of urban development. By necessity, this places major emphasis on a municipal perspective --in terms of conscientization and involvement of the local community, as well as in terms of policies and their implementation. It also implies that the concept of cultural patrimony must extend to intangible values such as language, music, traditional technologies, arts and crafts, customs and social texture.

9. In other words: the aim is to preserve and integrate the cultural patrimony --both movable and immovable; ancient and more recently created-- as an important element not only in socio-economic development, and in the enhancement of the quality of life, but also in reinforcing cultural identities. Cultural identity, in turn, has a profound political significance as an important element in nation-building, community building and the consolidation of regional and sub-regional solidarity.

---

(2) Cuzco, Churubusco and Belo Horizonte were the main examples of project-oriented training supported by the project. The Cuzco course was subsequently taken over by OAS and has now been discontinued.

10. This broad project outlook --emphasis on the integration of the cultural patrimony, and especially on the rehabilitation of historic centres in a live socio-economic context; municipal focus-- has obvious relevance to the interests of the poor, especially the urban poor. Beyond this, the project has also paid attention to other UN system-wide policy postulates --e.g. the participation of women, youth and the private sector-- although they cannot be expected to be central to the project. Lastly, the project has played a central coordinating role, consistent with UNDP policy, in supporting and utilizing or involving a variety of IGOs (UN and non-UN) and NGOs; see, in this connexion, para.s 45 to 48, below.
  
11. The overall conceptual orientation is apparent in all the activities generated or supported by the regional project --research, training, policy-oriented colloquia and seminars, publications, concrete preservation programmes. It is evident, however, that the insertion of a cultural heritage dimension in development constitutes a long term process in which cultural values must be reconciled with economic, social and political realities. Its success depends on a dialogue --and mutual understanding-- among the restoration technicians, architects and other professionals concerned with the cultural patrimony, the politicians, economists and urban planners concerned with development, and above all the communities directly involved. This has in fact been the main thrust of some of the most significant activities directly or indirectly attributable to the regional project and can best be illustrated by the examples of Quito and Havana, described in more detail in Annexes B, C and L.

12. In the area of training, this integrated approach was evident in the Inter-regional Course offered in Bahia with support from RLA/83/002. Social context and social impact figure prominently in most of the individual projects around which the course is built. It is stressed both by the students and by the teaching staff that while the training itself --offered to architects, engineers and some urban planners-- had to concentrate on technical aspects of physical conservation and restoration, an understanding of the social context and a dialogue with the community were of the essence in designing any conservation and restoration project.
13. In the consultative group meeting organized by the project manager during our stay in Lima, it was suggested that a systematic effort should be undertaken by a small working group under project auspices to develop a model for the economic evaluation of cultural heritage projects (see also below, para.54). While it may not be possible to reduce cultural values to a purely economic formula --e.g. in terms of the internal rates of return customarily considered for projects funded by multilateral lending agencies-- an attempt to take into account economic factors in developing more rigorous priority and comparative evaluation criteria for the conservation, restoration and rehabilitation of cultural assets will nevertheless be of considerable value, especially in the context of urban development and infrastructural investment projects. It was suggested --and the evaluation team agrees-- that this should whenever appropriate include a comparison of financial and social costs and benefits of the



rehabilitation of existing urban centres versus new construction, as well as the management of rehabilitation projects that preserve the historic or cultural characteristics of urban centres.<sup>(3)</sup> The Quito project (Annexes B and L) is an example of this approach.

#### Modus Operandi

14. To understand the way in which the project has been managed, and in particular the manner in which particular themes or activities are selected, it must be remembered that it operates as a collective effort of a variety of national actors and funding agencies. This has been possible thanks to the ability of the project manager to bring together these many actors and agencies, and to generate a constructive dialogue among them --by means of individual contacts as much as by structured meetings. In other words: the project has not played an ideological or messianic role, but contributed effectively to the development of concepts and ideas which are in turn reflected in policy or management decisions such as the choice of research topics, seminar topics, the orientation of training programmes and the choice of trainees and resource persons. Nor could it be said that activities were always selected according to a pre-determined strategy. They did, however, respond to concepts and priorities

---

(3) A rich literature is emerging in the economic modelling and valuation of the natural environment -- a closely related area.

held in the region; indeed, the project itself played, as already noted, a key role in the emergence of innovative and consistent strategies throughout Latin America and, more recently, also in the Caribbean.

15. Basic to this approach is the decentralized model of project management which the RLA/76/002 and 83/002 have refined over the years. The regional project provides a forum for joint reflection and policy development. It also proposes quality norms, institutional models, monitoring, diagnostic services, training and, generally, advice on methodologies of intervention. Line action, however, remains a national (or local) responsibility.
16. In this connexion, it is evident that the dynamism of the CTA, as well as his ability to empathize with counterparts, project staff and with the problems and aspirations of the region has been and continues to be of critical importance to the project as presently structured. It may thus well be that many of the more stimulating ideas for project action originated with him. What is important, however, is that these ideas have been internalized by the counterparts directly concerned, and can thus be considered as their own.
17. In addition to the personal role of the CTA in suggesting and stimulating particular activities, the project itself --especially the colloquia sponsored by it on key topics (see Annex F), and project involvement in UNESCO and UN-system normative action and large conferences such as AMERICULT (1978),

MUNDIACULT (1982),<sup>(4)</sup> Stockholm (1972) and HABITAT (1976) --has generated and disseminated many ideas which were subsequently followed up by project action. So have the joint learning experiences in regional training courses, and the systematic interchange of experts within the area.

18. An example of follow-up action generated by a project-sponsored colloquium were the regional training courses held between 1979 and 1986 in different parts of Latin America in fields such as museum management and administration, museums and education, museography and museum design, as well as a preliminary workshop on museums and conservation, and curriculum development for the training of museum personnel. The origin of these project activities in the area of museum development was a 1977 colloquium on Museology and Cultural Patrimony held in Bogota in collaboration with COLCULTURA and the Rome-based IILA. Other results of that colloquium, which focused on an area in which very little work had been done in Latin America, included a variety of studies on economic and financial aspects of museum development; national diagnostic studies on the state of museums; a diagnostic study (carried out jointly with ECLAC and the Conservation Institute of Barbados) on museums in the Caribbean area; feasibility studies for bankable museum development projects in Jamaica and Peru. The Bogota colloquium also led to concrete rehabilitation, renovation and adaptation of buildings for use as museums, e.g. in San José (Costa Rica), San Pedro

(4) World Conference on Cultural Policies; see also the various UNESCO conventions relating to the cultural patrimony.

de Zula (Honduras), Lima (National Museum of Anthropology and Archaeology) and various museums in Chile. The project was instrumental in setting up conservation centres in various museums for textiles, metals and ceramics. On-site workshops on preventive care were organized in coordination with the Smithsonian Institute in Costa Rica and Barbados (for Spanish- and English-speaking countries, respectively), and others are planned in Bolivia (for the Andean countries) and elsewhere. As noted in para. 27 below, special museology/conservation schools were created in Argentina, Brazil, Chile and Colombia. Lastly, a variety of foreign publications were translated for distribution within the area. TCDC was activated and a series of specific consultancies in particular areas were facilitated through the project.

Areas covered: gaps

19. As currently conceived and implemented, the project covers a wide variety of activities, described in further detail in Chapter IV below. No major gaps are apparent, but new areas of action are being prospected for the final phase of the project and possible follow-up after 1991 (see a more detailed discussion in Chapter IV below). They concern primarily research; rescue- industrial- and underwater archaeology, and the interface between the cultural and natural patrimony. While it is clear that these new areas fall within the purview of the present project objectives, they are contingent upon the mobilization of additional resources, including to the extent possible new extra-budgetary funding.

Relevance of the Project Document

20. Revision G of RLA/83/002 constitutes a complete project document for the activities to be undertaken in the Fourth Cycle (1987-91). Part I contains a comprehensive account and analysis of past project activities, reaching back to RLA/72/047, 76/002 and the first phase of RLA/83/002, and of the background in which the regional UNDP/UNESCO support has operated. This provided invaluable assistance in the understanding and assessment of the project activities by the evaluation team.
  
21. Part II of Revision G contains a statement of development objectives, a statement of immediate objectives, a statement of the expected results, as well as a comprehensive matrix linking project objectives and activities in a referential framework, and a tabulated project work plan. The statements of objectives and expected results, like the matrix, are extremely detailed --20 development objectives; 31 immediate objectives; 37 expected results! It should be remembered, in considering this ambitious document, that the project does not, by itself, have a line function in the execution of most training or conservation activities. Objectives and results listed in the project document are thus generally indirect. They do, in that sense, provide bench-marks to determine whether project inputs and outputs have contributed to meet the original expectations of the project sponsors. One might wonder, however, whether for a project in which flexibility, catalytic effect and responsiveness to new

demands are of the essence, and whose implementation and ultimate impact depend upon the availability of counterpart or extra-budgetary funding, it would not be more appropriate to have a shorter (framework) project document, couched in simpler, more generic language, supplemented by fully articulated annual work plans based on periodic evaluations of impact and continued relevance. (In fact, the project has been managed with a great deal of flexibility, and its schedule and sequence of activities has adjusted to counterpart needs as well as to the availability of counterpart and other extra-budgetary funding; annual workplans have been proposed, and seem generally more concrete -- or real -- than the project document itself).

### III. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

#### Implementation Rates

22. In the period 1978 to 88, implementation rates have ranged from 98 to 107 % of the programmed project budgets. Only in 1982 did the implementation rate fall below the 100 % mark. While this exceptionally high implementation rate must be seen as a positive fact --indicating an active demand and the ability of the project to deliver--, it may also imply that the project was under-budg-

eted. This problem --including the pattern of declining annual allocations (in nominal as well as in real terms) during the programme cycle, and the need for a sufficient core budget to sustain the catalytic role of the project and its ability to mobilize additional resources in terms of cost-sharing and extra-budgetary resources -- is addressed in para. 49 to 52, below.

#### Status Report on Particular Types of Activities

23. The substantive project contents, as related to its main objectives, are described and discussed in Chapter IV below. They encompass a wide range of activities, many of them inter-related and inter-active: inventory and cataloguing; legislation and cultural policies; conservation of movable and immovable cultural objects and sites; archaeology and archaeological conservation, museum development; architecture, especially the readaptation of historic buildings and sites; cultural promotion and communications; endogenous technologies; administration and financing of cultural projects; disaster planning; South-South co-operation in relation to all these activities and -- in future -- the interface cultural and natural patrimony.
24. The present chapter, on the other hand, is primarily intended to consider this rich menu from the perspective of the various types of activities envisaged

in revision G<sup>(5)</sup>, i.e.:

- (i) Human resource development: training courses;
- (ii) Topical seminars, colloquia and workshops;
- (iii) Research, individual or by working groups, related reports;
- (iv) Publications, including the production and dissemination of didactic and conscientization materials (text, video, etc.);
- (v) Advisory services, including the exchange of experts and consultants within (and to some extent also outside) the region.

In most instances, these distinct types of activities are interrelated and interactive, and a combination of them is required to attain a given project objective, much as the immediate project objectives are interlinked in the perspective of the overall development objectives discussed in Chapter IV.

#### Human Resource Development: Training Courses

25. The training activities conducted under project auspices are enumerated in Annexes D and E to this report. It will be seen from the list of courses that

---

(5) Our evaluation focused primarily on activities undertaken on the basis of Revision G, which itself had been formulated after a thorough project revision reflected in the project document; in some instances, however, we used data covering the time series 1978-88.



the main emphasis during the past decade has been on the conservation of movable cultural property, generally with a focus on particular materials; the conservation of historical monuments, buildings and sites in the context of urban development and rehabilitation; museum development, museology and museum management.

26. In the period 1978 to 1988, the project sponsored or was thus involved in 43 training courses with a regional scope, with 1121 participants of which only a small proportion was funded by the project; the main international sources of extra-budgetary funding were UNESCO (RP as well as WHF), the Getty trust and UNDP country programmes. The 1121 participants came from Latin American and Caribbean countries or from related cultural areas (Lusophone Africa; Portugal). In some instances where the subject-matter justified it, participants from other countries were also included (e.g. adobe; seismology and disaster planning; archaeology). External lecturers were as a rule identified and recruited through the project even if, as for participants, much of the funding came from extra-budgetary sources. In most instances the training courses were organized jointly with national institutions, which assumed day-to-day responsibility for the training. Beyond the mobilization of extra-budgetary resources, and the identification of resource persons and participants, the regional project also provided advice and support in areas such as curriculum development, training materials, evaluation and follow-up. In general, it can be said that the close relationship --and complementarity-- between national in-

stitutions and the regional project was particularly fruitful in connection with training activities, as was the co-operation with IGOs and NGOs concerned with the cultural patrimony (ICCROM, Getty Trust, ICOM, etc.)

27. It will be noted from the Annexes that some training courses addressing general topics had a substantial duration and were of a continuing or recurrent nature (e.g. the course in Bahia). Other training courses were more sharply targeted, either on specific topics (particular materials or technologies), or to build up the staff of national institutions. The current trend is to use the regional project for the training of trainers, especially with regard to particular technologies, materials and management activities. It should also be noted that through the efforts of the regional project subjects related to the cultural heritage are increasingly being integrated in graduate and post-graduate curricula in a variety of disciplines, particularly architecture, fine arts and urbanism (Bahia, Lima, Havana, Bogota, Cordoba, etc.), or are being offered in special museology/conservation schools (Buenos Aires, Rio de Janeiro, Chile, Colombia, etc.).
28. In the special courses sponsored by the regional project, training methods were characterized by an active, participatory approach and a practical rather than theoretical orientation. In many courses --e.g. the Bahia course-- great emphasis was thus placed on practical projects carried out by individual or groups of participants. Foreign resource persons were inserted in the program-

me in a targeted fashion, generally for a particular lecture or cluster of lectures. The course contents and training materials were evidently inspired by the conceptual approach of the regional project, or directly derived from it. This in turn ensured that materials and ideas produced by institutions such as ICCROM were adjusted to the realities of the area. As regards the regional composition of the student body, including the presence of external participants (principally from Lusophone Africa and Portugal), both the teaching staff and the trainees themselves confirmed that it had enriched the courses: no doubt the joint learning experience contributed to the overall impact, spread and multiplier effect of the project. For longer training courses such as the one in Bahia, it is felt that in future all foreign participants should undergo a period of familiarization or preparation before the beginning of the actual course work.

29. In conclusion, it is evident that the training courses initiated and organized with regional project support have been highly successful. Much of the multiplier effect which characterized the project was attributable to them. Often training courses served also a brainstorming function, prospecting new approaches and concepts and developing them in the context of regional or sub-regional realities. This means that training, reflection and policy formulation have been closely interrelated. Even courses of a technical nature contributed to the conscientization of essential actors in the process of conservation and integration of the cultural heritage in national and community development;

they have helped to formulate and disseminate new ideas and technological solutions; whenever they were carried out on a regional or sub-regional basis they have been instrumental in consolidating South-South linkages in the area.

#### Topical Seminars, Colloquia and Workshops

30. The list of topical seminars, colloquia and workshops is attached as Annex F. In the remaining years of the current project, 19 such events are proposed, on topics ranging from the conservation of pre-Columbian textiles to the discussion of case studies on the rehabilitation of historic centres, education and museums, conservation of the ecosystem, ecology and cultural environment, conservation of cultural assets in the event of natural disasters, culture and development, the role of foundations and museum architecture, etc..
31. Participants and resource persons from within and outside the region were carefully selected, ensuring the setting for meaningful discussion and dissemination of the results. Documentation was generally of a high quality; where materials were drawn from external sources (UNESCO, ICCROM, various professional organizations), care was taken to adapt them to the perspectives of the region. In many instances the documentation, proceedings and conclusions were subsequently edited and distributed as project or project-related publications (see Annex G).

32. It was already noted that colloquia, workshops and seminars were deliberately used to develop new concepts and approaches, and introduce new technologies for the preservation and management of cultural assets. In that sense, they played a seminal role both in policy formulation and as a basis for operational action under project auspices or independently of it. The example of the 1977 Bogota Colloquium on Museology and Cultural Patrimony (para. 18 above) illustrates this point.

#### Research, Surveys, Diagnostic Studies

33. Much of the research carried out under project auspices has been related to --or grew out of-- the training activities and the colloquia/seminars/workshops discussed in the preceding two sub-chapters. Some of the research has focused on particular materials, their utilization and conservation (e.g. adobe or textiles). Other research, in the form of case- or diagnostic studies, has concentrated on particular sites or historic centres. Still other research efforts have had a broader topical focus, e.g. the research on the integration of cultural areas in development, especially urban development, natural disasters, issues of management and archaeology.
34. In line with the overall approach of the project, the research has generally been entrusted to external institutions or research teams, preferably within

the region; it has received substantial extra-budgetary support in terms of co-funding or in kind contributions from a variety of sources. As a rule, the results were published either by the project or with project co-sponsorship.

35. It may be concluded, in general terms, that the list of research topics corresponded to the major areas of interest of the project in the years under review, and that the modalities of execution and quality of the research output were adequate. It is nevertheless suggested that research activities should be strengthened and expanded in the remaining years of the project, also with a view to follow-up action after 1991. This calls for a deliberate strategy to build up institutions, networks and systematic exchanges of information which will enable them to function without external tutelage; obviously, collaboration with research bodies outside the region will retain its importance, especially in areas of advanced technology (e.g. in conservation and conservation techniques), but maximum use should be made of indigenous research capacity whenever local conditions (climate, etc.), materials and technologies are to be considered.

#### Publications and Video-Materials

36. The list of project or project-sponsored publications is attached as Annex G. It covers a variety of titles directly related to (and derived from) project

activities, including didactic and conscientization materials; among the latter are video materials and posters, as well as simple texts or comic strips addressed to children. The project has also been instrumental, with extra-budgetary funding, in the translation into Spanish of bulletins and other materials produced by specialized bodies such as ICOM and ICCROM, as well as by individual authors.

37. While the range and quality of the project publications are generally good, some problems remain with regard to their distribution. In one case, a publication was produced jointly with a commercial publisher ("Arqueología Andina", Milla (Lima)), who contributed its own distribution list and network. In general, however, the project has had to rely on its own lists and ad hoc distribution arrangements, supplemented by the mailing lists of institutions such as ICCROM and ICOM.
38. Several suggestions were made with regard to future publications policy. One was to produce a bi-monthly project bulletin, which would also list (and perhaps abstract) project and project-related publications. Another was to convene a seminar on documentation and publications, as part of an effort to systematize information exchanges in the region. Lastly, it was felt that joint publication with commercial publishers would be possible for a variety of new titles, with all the advantages this implied in terms of distribution.

Advisory Services; Exchange of Experts

39. The project has been instrumental in providing, on demand, a wide variety of advisory services which ranged from very specific missions (e.g. the study and preservation of particular objects) to integrated advisory projects. Over time, the focus has shifted from inventory and diagnostic activities to preservation/restoration, museum development/museology, institutional design and project formulation, including pre-investment or feasibility studies for bankable projects.
40. In some instances, these advisory services were provided by the regional project or project staff. More frequently, however, the role of the project was to identify and recruit experts --increasingly from the region--, to help in mobilizing outside funding, and occasionally to monitor or supervise implementation.
41. In this context, particular significance attaches to the role of the project in encouraging the use of experts from the region. This does not mean that experts from other parts of the world should be excluded --especially where they can contribute particular technical skills (e.g. in conservation and restoration) and acquire sufficient empathy with the needs and perspectives of the region. It is evident, however, that there exists in the region a growing reservoir of knowledge and skills that can be tapped for advisory services,



and that the project is in a unique position to identify and mobilize them thus promoting exchanges of experts and expertise which will, in the long run, be essential to consolidate cultural consciousness in Latin America and the Caribbean.

#### Backstopping

42. There have been no problems with the backstopping of the project by UNESCO and the project management. In fact, the CTA has operated with a high degree of autonomy, meaning that as a rule UNESCO has not been called upon to provide much substantive or administrative backstopping; conversely, the project management has exercised in the region supporting functions on behalf of UNESCO, including the supervision of UNESCO-executed national and sub-regional UNDP projects. Since all these UNESCO activities (WHF, MAB, Regular Programme, etc.) were closely related to, and indeed expected to supplement and interact with the regional project, this arrangement has been mutually advantageous. In the period 1981 to 88, for instance, UNESCO and UNESCO/WHF funds administered by the project amounted to over 500.000 Dollars, quite apart from other UNESCO and WHF activities in the region (see Annex I).
43. It is also evident that the closeness of the project to UNESCO policy and normative action in the areas of culture, education, science and technology and social development, including global policy events such as MUNDIACULT, has

greatly enriched the regional project and its conceptual matrix. This will no doubt also be the case for the forthcoming UNESCO Cultural Decade, in which the RLAC/83/002 is expected to play an active role. In fact, we consider the field/headquarters collaboration which has developed in this project as a relevant model for other agency-executed UNDP regional action.

#### Relation with National Projects

44. As noted earlier, while the regional project has moved from its original Andean focus to a broader scope encompassing 30 countries in Latin America and the Caribbean, it has, over the years, generated a number of national and sub-regional projects which fall within the overall framework of its objectives. Some of these national or sub-regional projects are UNDP-funded; others are funded by bilateral or NGO programmes. In most instances the CTA has played a key role in formulating these projects, and continues to serve, at no cost, as project manager or (with regard to bilateral projects) as an informal adviser. In many instances bilateral programmes or NGOs which had no operational infrastructure in the region have been able to use the administrative and central management services of RLAC/83/002. As a result, the regional project and the national projects have been joined to form a broad mosaic of activities sponsored not only by UNDP, but also by a variety of other agencies.

Co-operation with IGOs and NGOs

45. The project has thus developed close --and mutually beneficial-- links with many organizations and programmes concerned with cultural development. These links have been important not only to gain access to extra-budgetary funding, but also to ensure consistency and impact of the external support for the cultural patrimony in Latin America and the Caribbean.
46. Apart from UNESCO and the UNESCO/WHF, relations with intergovernmental organizations have been particularly intensive with ICCROM, but also with UN-system organizations such as UNDRO, for disaster prevention and relief, UNEP, in terms of the interface natural and cultural patrimony, HABITAT in the area of urban development, ECLAC, ILO, UNICEF, FAO, WTO, UNFPA and WHO. The project has also collaborated with multilateral funding agencies such as the World Bank and the Interamerican Bank, as well as with the Organization of American States.
47. Lastly, the project has maintained close contact with NGOs, and in particular professional organizations such as ICOM and ICOMOS which are directly concerned with the preservation of the cultural patrimony. Some concern was expressed, however, over the fact that these professional bodies were not fully representative, at least in the region. Greater openness to all those concerned with the cultural heritage would be desirable, and would no doubt make them more effective partners of the regional project. It might thus be considered wheth-

ther continuation of the direct support which organizations such as ICOM and ICOMOS receive from UNESCO should not be contingent upon their representativity.

48. On the other hand, collaboration --and complementarity-- with several foundations, and in particular with the J. Paul Getty Trust and its Conservation Institute, has been particularly fruitful. It is expected that, in line with a recent memorandum of understanding, joint action with the Getty Conservation Institute will grow very significantly in the coming years.

#### Fund-raising and UNDP core funding

49. It has already been noted that, as presently conceived and funded, the regional project presupposes the availability of substantial external resources in addition to the core UNDP contribution. It was also pointed out that the project management had been remarkably successful in mobilizing such additional funding from a variety of sources --governmental, inter-governmental and private, national as well as international-- without compromising the fundamental nature and objectives of the project. A tabulated summary of these external contributions --due as much to the personal efforts of the CTA as to the open, participatory nature of the project-- is attached as Annex K; it should be noted, however, that beyond these quantified external contributions, which amount to some 45% of the UNDP input over the period 1983-88, the project has stimulated at national and local level a great deal of unrecorded action coherent with its objectives. This includes investment in museum building, presentation of

monuments, organ rehabilitation projects, etc. The UNDP-funded national and sub-regional projects constitute only a minor part of this.

50. Most of the additional funds mobilized in the context of the regional project are of an extra-budgetary nature, i.e. they do not appear in the regional project budget, and generate no overhead charges. We consider this to be justified and consistent with the catalytic functions of the regional project. As matters stand, extra-budgetary funding consists essentially of counterpart contributions (mentioned in the project document but not in the project budget) and co-financing arrangements with respect to particular activities or clusters of activities covered by the project. An example of the latter is the recent memorandum of understanding with the Getty Conservation Institute. The evaluation mission did not attempt to verify whether the specific counterpart or co-funding obligations were in fact lived up to. It may be concluded from the results of the project, however, that they were substantially honored.

51. The project manager envisages, in future, to explore the possibility of establishing a UNDP-administered trust fund or trust funds to strengthen the core project budget. It is not likely, however, that such a trust fund and other cost-sharing will be sufficient to bridge the difference between the UNDP con -

tributions,<sup>(6)</sup> as currently programmed for the remaining years of the project, and the projections suggested by the CTA (see Annex K).

52. In fact, annual allocations for the remainder of the project have declined from \$ 471.745 in 1987 to 247.000 for 1990 and 204.000 for 1991, subject to an upward revision after the present evaluation exercise. (in 6, above) Several considerations are submitted in that connexion. In the first place, it is evident --as noted earlier-- that to play its central coordinating role and mobilize additional extra-budgetary resources or significant co-financing, assured core funding (i.e. funding from UNDP) cannot fall below a certain threshold. This threshold is contingent upon the nature and objectives of the project as defined in the current project document (Revision G) and discussed above. In the opinion of the CTA, which we share in principle, the central functions (which must be covered by assured central funding) presuppose not only an effective project staff, but also some operational resources for consultants, meetings, travel, etc. (the budgetary projections submitted by the CTA are attached as Annex K). As matters stand, the reduced annual allocations --further eroded by inflation-- are barely sufficient to cover the salaries of the CTA and a minimum administrative support staff. Even if it is assumed that, with the help

(6) The possibility of additional funding after an evaluation was made explicit in the texts of Revisions I and K, as well as in a communication from the UNDP RR to UNDP HQ when Revision G was approved in 1986 (Misc. 357).

of UNDP/UNESCO, the project will be able to count on some JPOs, Associate Experts or Volunteers, we believe that the project budget should cover a professional assistant (currently funded under the Peru IPF), funds for the production of a bi-monthly bulletin, for a round-table meeting on follow-up strategies and action, and sufficient seed money to "operational" activities as discussed in this report. While we have no precise figure to propose, we suggest that this matter be discussed at an early date with the CTA.

#### Project Staff

53. The regional project has been functioning with a very small permanent staff supplemented by short-term consultants. In addition to the CTA, the professional staff has consisted primarily of JPOs/Associate experts (36 M/M in the period 1984/86, and 24 M/M 87/88). Their recruitment was facilitated by the reputation of, and interest in the project in a number of donor countries. In one instance, a JPO/Associate Expert continued working with the project on a Special Service Agreement. In another instance an ex-UN Volunteer accepted a Special Service Agreement with UNESCO and UNESCO/WHF funding. Given the contractual terms that could be offered, however, these arrangements were not entirely fair to them (very modest salaries; no fringe benefits or job security). The performance of this junior professional staff has nevertheless been outstanding; the CTA has known how to motivate them and give them free enough reins to optimize their enthusiasm, creativity and professional skills.

Pre-investment and Investment

54. Preservation of the cultural heritage, and its integration in the social and economic environment, must be expected to call for investments which go much beyond the scope of technical co-operation; in Latin America and the Caribbean this frequently means multilateral financing from the IBRD or IDB. In exceptional cases, such investment projects may be specific to a cultural centre or complex; the IDB has been particularly interested in such cultural projects. More often, however, a cultural heritage dimension must be inserted in infra-structural projects --e.g. urban renewal; urban rehabilitation-- which might otherwise destroy many of the values to be preserved. Similarly, the building of roads, dams and other civil engineering projects may, in a region as rich with archaeological sites as Latin America and the Caribbean, require measures to prevent unnecessary damage to the cultural patrimony. Lastly, the cultural patrimony may, subject to adequate protection of its integrity, play an important role in the development of tourism.
55. In that perspective, RLAC/83/002 has concentrated its efforts on the pre-investment stage of a variety of projects. On the one hand, it has sought to articulate integrated cultural preservation projects such as one prepared for Jamaica in 1987, with cost-sharing from the Inter-American Development Bank. On the other hand, it has proposed, in connexion with urban development or engineering projects, measures designed to conserve and rehabilitate culturally



important historical centres and their socio-cultural texture. The activities of the project in Bogota and Quito are cases in point. It must be expected that the demand for technical assistance in this area will expand considerably in coming years, attributing particular relevance to the proposed model for the economic evaluation and management of cultural projects.

Geographic Scope, Within and Outside the Region

56. The regional project has grown from an Andean focus to a broader regional scope involving 30 countries. Most recently, the English-speaking Caribbean sub-area has been integrated in the regional effort. Given the language problem --and also the different cultural matrix-- some of the project activities, especially training, may have to be conducted on a sub-regional basis. It is nevertheless hoped that the project will be able to stimulate a cross-flow of experience and promote consistent policies among all the countries of the region.
57. At the same time, project activities have begun to spill over into other regions. The CTA, in his individual capacity, has advised in the formulation and been involved in the assessment of extra-regional UNDP/UNESCO cultural heritage projects (Morocco, Portugal, Turkey, Yemen). Specific project activities --especially training-- have included participants from Lusophone Africa and Portugal. Some of the colloquia focusing on particular materials (e.g.

adobe) have included participants from countries outside the region in which these materials have traditionally been used.

58. We would nevertheless conclude that the project should, in principle, retain its present regional parameters. This would not preclude operational interfaces with other regions, in particular:

- with countries such as Lusophone Africa, Spain and Portugal, whose cultural matrix is related to that of Latin America;
- where the subject-matter --e.g. a focus on materials such as adobe, ceramics, textiles, or particular forms of expression such as rock art-- justifies joint research, reflection and perhaps action with countries outside the region where the same materials have been in traditional use.

Lastly, it may be hoped that the regional project and some of the concepts and activities it has generated may serve as models in other parts of the world, and that experts from the region will --like the CTA-- be available for extra-regional advisory missions.

Evaluation and Monitoring

59. The project has been the object of internal evaluations and monitoring. Both have effectively been used as management tools. A comprehensive evaluation is thus contained in Revision G of the project.
60. Among the more significant assessments of particular project activities is the recent evaluation of all training courses, demonstrating remarkable rates of reintegration and growth of the trainees in their professional careers, a key fact in explaining the broad and continuing impact which the project has had throughout the region. An in-depth evaluation of four training courses was also carried out during the current phase of the project. So was an evaluation of all conservation centres which the project has helped to establish in Latin America and the Caribbean, covering physical infrastructure, human resource development, financial and economic parameters and long-term stability and continuity.
61. Internal monitoring practices have become an established part of all project activities. They are reflected in an annual monitoring document, discussed regularly among the project staff, and reported in the first quarter of each year to the participating governments, UNDP and UNESCO. The senior consultative group in which we participated in Lima also plays a key monitoring and evaluation function.

#### IV. RESULTS AND FOLLOW-UP PERSPECTIVES

62. As already noted, the project has organized, since its inception, 43 regional training courses attended by 1121 participants, and has been involved in a very great number of national training activities. It has organized 25 colloquia and workshops attended by 1237 participants, produced 75 publications, 27 videos, 2 films, 18 translations and 34 posters. These are remarkable achievements, which are reflected in the qualitative results discussed in this chapter.
  
63. In general terms, the most important results of the project were to increase the awareness of cultural values and assets throughout the region, opening policy perspectives and initiating action at national, local and sub-regional level, to protect the cultural patrimony and to integrate it in the context of their social and economic environment. Significantly, this was done without creating a permanent institutional infrastructure. Instead, the project relied on national or local institutions --assisting whenever necessary in their establishment and management-- and encouraged them to form regional or sub-regional networks operating in a decentralized pattern with a high degree of autonomy.

### Inventory, Cataloguing, Surveys

64. The inventorying of movable objects, especially for conservation purposes, has proceeded at a satisfactory pace in most of the region. The project was instrumental in the establishment of national inventory units, training their staff and assisting them with advisory services. A systematic effort remains to be done, however, to interlink these national units and their inventories. Progress has been slower at the level of particular museums, where inventorying is an important step in conservation.
65. The inventorying of immovables has also made considerable progress, in particular where individual monuments are concerned. The emphasis is now on urban complexes, especially the historic centres and inner cities, for which new technical aids have become available (photogrammetry, etc.). The project contributed several diagnostic studies --e.g. the inventory covering the city of Bahia, in Brazil. In some countries the inventorying of the immovable cultural patrimony is entrusted to special inventory units (Peru; Cuba). In others it is left to universities or ad-hoc efforts. In either case the project has provided support, especially in the form of training.
66. Relatively little has been done with regard to inventories of intangible cultural assets --e.g. technologies and artisanal skills; performing arts; oral

traditions. Project activities were limited to music (Andean Baroque music) and to an inventory of traditional technologies established (and discussed in a colloquium) in Brazil, with emphasis on rural technologies and building materials. There is no doubt that intangible values constitute an important part of the cultural patrimony. However, systematic work in that area transcends the objectives and current resources of the regional project, and should probably best be undertaken by research bodies or universities.

#### Conservation of Movable Objects

67. Project support in this area has taken the form of training --both on conservation methods and particular objects and materials--, institution-building and institutional strengthening, and a variety of specific advisory missions. A 1987 publication, "Conservation Centres in Latin America and the Caribbean", has been given wide distribution in Spanish and English.
68. The general approach taken by the project has been to assist in the creation of conservation centres at the national level (or at the level of particular regions in some of the larger countries), supplemented by more specialized intervention and research centres. Over the years, there has been a tendency to integrate conservation activities for movable and immovable objects.

69. Basic conservation centres are increasingly located in situ (e.g. San Francisco in Lima; historic centres or archaeological sites), in museums or in some universities. Being close to the objects to be preserved, they have a diagnostic and management function, but they may also conduct research on particular objects and their conservation.
70. The more advanced, specialized centres (which may also, like the pre-Columbian textile centre in Lima, have a basic conservation function) are particularly concerned with restoration and advanced technologies applied to conservation and research relating to particular materials or objects. The project has encouraged the emergence --and whenever appropriate the net-working-- of such specialized centres of excellence. It has also provided direct support in the form of technical assistance, training in new technologies and the training of trainers.
71. There is general agreement that project action in this area has been successful, but that continued support is needed both in institution-building, institutional strengthening and management, as well as to introduce or adapt new technologies.

### Conservation of Immovables and Sites

72. As noted above, the current tendency is to integrate the conservation of movables and immovables, especially in the sense that the centres entrusted with the conservation of movables are increasingly located in situ. This also corresponds to the concept that cultural assets must be viewed --and preserved-- in their environment.
73. On the other hand, it has been noted that the conservation of immovables and sites is a slower process than the conservation of movables, and that much remains to be done in that area. There are several reasons for this. One is that the conservation of immovables is generally part of urban development and rehabilitation --itself a slow and capital-intensive process. Another reason is that the conservation of immovables calls for the active participation of specialists from a variety of disciplines, notably architects and civil engineers; it is important that conservation and restoration functions be integrated. Lastly, it has become apparent that there exists no single model for the conservation/restoration of immovables, sites and historic complexes: both the concepts and the technical problems encountered depend to a large extent on varying local conditions.
74. As matters stand, the project has been active in the conservation of some major sites and historic complexes --among them Cuzco, Quito and at present also



in Bahia. Its main efforts, however, have been in the area of project design, where it has provided both training and direct technical assistance.

75. Project design in the area of conservation and restoration of immovable cultural assets includes feasibility or pre-investment studies, and as such touches not only on technical aspects, but also on legislation and building regulations, and above all on issues of economics, financial engineering and management. It is in that context, for instance, that the economic valuation and modelling mentioned in para. 13 above is particularly relevant.
76. It may be concluded that this will be one of the priority areas for the remaining years of the current project, and also for follow-up action beyond 1991. It will call for an interdisciplinary approach and for close co-operation with national and multilateral funding agencies, as well as with the main actors in urban development.

#### Museum Development

77. There is general agreement that project activities in this area have been both innovative and effective, but that there remains a need for continuing follow-up action.

78. At the conceptual level, the project has been instrumental, by its colloquia and training activities (e.g. the 1977 Bogota seminar and follow-up, para. 25 above) as well as by a series of diagnostic studies conducted at national level, in raising public consciousness, introducing new museological approaches and above all in bringing museums closer to the community. It has also been instrumental in introducing museology courses in the curriculum of various schools of architecture and fine arts.
79. Beyond its contributions in the fields of museology and museography, the project has given considerable attention to the physical museum infrastructure --updating and upgrading existing museums; building of new museums; adaptation of historic buildings for use as museums. In all instances, however, it was stressed that a substantive programme was an essential prerequisite for valid architectural solutions.
80. Two related areas in which the project has made an important contribution are security, and especially also preventive and rescue measures in the event of natural disasters (earthquakes, floods) endemic in the region.
81. The project has also emphasized the educational function of museums --in terms of educational planning in the context of museum programmes, and by the production of educational kits, video-materials and publications in comic-strip form.

82. Lastly --and perhaps most importantly-- the project has paid major attention to museum management, and to the formulation of "bankable" museum projects which take account of economic and financial parameters. Apart from specific technical assistance provided on demand, including some concrete feasibility studies, it has helped in opening up new perspectives in this connexion.
83. There is general agreement that museum management, museum economics and informatization should be seen as future priority areas for the project.

#### Archaeology

84. While the project has been instrumental in the establishment of some advanced training courses in archaeology (e.g. in the Escuela Superior Politécnica in Guayaquil, and in Arica/Antofagasta), and while its inventorying, conservation and museological activities have included archaeological objects, it has given relatively little attention to actual archaeological activities or techniques.
85. Current project resources are obviously insufficient to undertake substantial work in this field. It may nevertheless be desirable, in line with the overall project objectives, to fill some lacunae which have been noted in the area.

One relates to rescue archaeology, especially in the context of major civil engineering projects (roads, dams, urban development, etc.). Another is the area of under-water archaeology. Industrial archaeology (especially in countries such as Bolivia, Brazil, Argentina and the Caribbean) may also deserve some attention, as would the general subject of in-situ conservation.

#### Endogenous Technologies

86. Project action related to intangible cultural assets has focused primarily on endogenous technologies --i.e. the recording and preservation of traditional skills which form part of the cultural context and are thus particularly important in mobilizing community support for cultural development.
87. The Brasilia regional colloquium convened in 1982, with a focus on traditional agricultural techniques and building materials, was a first step in this direction. So were the seminars on adobe and wood organized by the project.
88. There is no doubt that this general area, and in particular the preservation of artisanal skills and techniques which are rapidly disappearing throughout the region, deserves major attention in coming years. It is also felt, however, that beyond a series of specific follow-up activities directly related to other

parts of its programme of work, the regional project, as presently structured and funded, is not in a position to give priority to this subject.

#### Administration and Financing of Cultural Projects

89. The nature and importance of the project contributions in this field have been discussed elsewhere in this report (e.g. para. 75 and 82).
90. There is no doubt that this work must continue and indeed be intensified in the remaining years of the project, and in particular also in follow-up action after 1991

#### Disaster Prevention and Relief

91. In addition to advisory services following the Quito and Mexico earthquakes, the project --in close co-operation with UNDRO-- has made an important contribution both in devising preventive measures and in the planning of remedial action for damage caused to the cultural patrimony by natural disasters. With regard to prevention, it has focused not only on anti-seismic museum architecture, but also on adequate storage areas and museum displays.

92. A first intervention, followed by a colloquium on Preventive Measures for the Protection of Historic Monuments and Sites was cosponsored with UNDRO in 1979 in Antigua (Guatemala). The proceedings of the colloquium were published in 1983. In 1986, a steering committee was convened in Lima with the Getty Trust and other institutions. Case studies were completed in the Caribbean, Central America and the Andean region for movable assets, and in Chile for museums.
93. There is agreement that work in this area should continue in the form of training, dissemination of preventive and rescue technologies, and to encourage adequate advance planning.

#### Cultural Promotion and Communications

94. It has already been noted that policies for the protection of the cultural patrimony, but also the seminal effect of the regional project, depend on effective cultural promotion and communications.
95. The project has thus made a major effort to reach the communities concerned, as well as national and local governments, through its publications, video materials and the conscientization components built into many of its activities, and has encouraged governments and cultural preservation institutions to give high priority to promotion and communications.

96. In a wider context, it is also important to reach and conscientize the public, governments and potential funding agencies outside the region. This has to some extent been achieved by the project publications. It is hoped, however, that in future the project will be able to count on active support of the information and communications services of UNDP and UNESCO; valuable assistance has already been given by UNDP/OPI, as well as by the World Heritage Fund.

#### V. FOLLOW-UP AND SUSTAINABILITY

97. Our comments on follow-up perspectives and sustainability are found in Chapters IV and II above, respectively. Our conclusions on both counts are positive: there continues to be a demand for the project, in all likelihood beyond 1991; topics and priorities for follow-up action are clearly defined, but should be the subject of a round-table discussion before the conclusion of the present project, both to verify the continued relevance of these priorities and the best form which continued external support might take. The ultimate objective must, of course, be the self-sufficiency of national institutions and regional networks.

## VI. LESSONS LEARNED

98. Three main types of lessons can be learned from RLAC/83/002 and its precursor projects. One relates to the process and planning parameters of UNDP support; the other relates to the modus operandi of regional projects, and the third to the conceptual approach of technical assistance in the area of the cultural patrimony.
99. As regards the planning process, it may be concluded that the setting of broad goals, as reflected in Revision G, is essential to give the project consistency in time and space; it would probably be sufficient, however, if the project document defined policy goals and operational objectives in fairly general terms, placing major emphasis on the formulation of agreed annual work plans coherent with the actual level of counterpart contributions, extra-budgetary funding and cost-sharing available to attain specific objectives; the mechanisms by which such agreed work plans are discussed and formulated should be mentioned specifically in the project document.
100. In this connexion, some comments must be made with regard to the financial structure of the project. Central funding by UNDP is obviously of critical importance to sustain, with sufficient guarantees of continuity, the basic project functions, and also to serve as "seed money" for activities co-financed



from other sources; this is, in essence, what one refers to as the central co-ordination and funding role of UNDP. In the specific case of RLAC/83/002, the central funding was sufficient for the first years of the programme cycle; as in many other large projects, however, regional as well as national, annual budget allocations were programmed to decline over the cycle even in nominal terms. This approach may be justified in regions and projects where technical assistance programmes are expected to under-deliver. For projects which, like the one under review, consistently show high implementation rates and even exceed annual allocations, under-budgeting for the final years of a programming cycle inhibits creative planning and continuity of action even if, as for RLAC/83/002 Rev. G, there was agreement in principle that budget allocations might be increased subject to an evaluation and the availability of funds.

101. As regards the modus operandi, the project has clearly demonstrated the advantages of a decentralized approach, building upon --and stimulating-- the co-operation of national institutions rather than relying on an institutionalized central project suprastructure. For this model to operate successfully, however, it is important that there be a CTA stationed in the field, and that the role of the executing agency focus less on actual project management and administration than on conceptual guidance such as that derived from UNESCO's (non-technical assistance) normative and policy functions. Over time, efforts should of course be made to ensure that the national institutions operate (and collaborate in a network pattern) with increasing autonomy; this, however, is a

long-term process which, given the complexity of the subject matter, has not yet been completed in the context of RLAC/83/002, and will in all likelihood require continuing external support beyond the current programming cycle.

102. As regards the conceptual approach adopted by the project under review, a significant lesson can be derived from the success of its efforts to integrate the cultural patrimony and its preservation in the broader context of social and economic development. It is evident that this calls for a pluridisciplinary approach, and for close working links with multinational and national institutions operating in other fields -- in this case economic development and development financing; urban development; education; science and technology, etc.

## VII. FINDINGS

103. The main findings of the evaluation mission can be summarized as follows:
- (i) The project deserves high marks in terms of relevance and policy impact; it has been both innovative and responsive to needs and demand; its im-

pact is to a large extent attributable to an emphasis on human resource development, to a decentralized pattern of operation and to the fact that it functioned without a heavy institutional supra-structure;

- (ii) in spite of a very detailed and formal project document, it has operated in a flexible manner, adapting to new demands, perspectives and priorities;
- (iii) the project has had a catalytic effect both in terms of stimulating decentralized action at national level, and in terms of mobilizing additional financial resources, mostly in the form of co-financing and counterpart funding rather than by cost-sharing; it has grown from a narrow Andean focus to a project involving all but one country of Latin America, and more recently also the English-speaking Caribbean area;
- (iv) the project has been very successful in stimulating South-South co-operation; this has taken the form of exchanges of experts and expertise, but also of co-operation and networking among the many national institutions involved in the project;
- (v) the project was instrumental in the establishment of many national and sub-regional projects funded by UNDP and other bilateral or NGO sources;

it has provided guidance and, in some cases, the management of these national projects, placing its operational field infrastructure at the disposal of funding agencies which required it, and ensuring consistency and interactivity among the respective projects; it should, in future continue to serve as an umbrella for all regional and sub-regional UNDP action relating to the cultural patrimony;

- (vi) backstopping arrangements with UNESCO have worked well; while the project staff has enjoyed considerable autonomy, it has benefited from close links with UNESCO's policy and normative action, and from the fact that many UNESCO and UNESCO/WHF operational activities in the region were administered by the UNDP/UNESCO project staff;
- (vii) the project has operated on a very tight budget, which might be insufficient to carry it to its conclusion in 1991; it has had a very high implementation rate.

#### VIII. RECOMMENDATIONS

104. On the basis of its findings, the evaluation mission submits the following recommendations relating to funding:

- (i) additional core funding should be made available to sustain the central project functions in the remaining years of the programming cycle; in addition to regional IPF resources, efforts should be made to obtain trust fund contributions and other cost-sharing in the context of the project budget; other avenues to be explored jointly by UNDP, UNESCO and the project staff are the recruitment of JPOs and Associate Experts, as well as the possibility of charging some of the costs of the CTA and central project staff to national UNDP projects prepared, managed or supervised by the CTA. While the evaluation team is not in a position to suggest a concrete figure for this additional funding, it recommends that the subject be considered as a matter of urgency by UNDP and the CTA, using as a point of departure the budgetary projections formulated by the latter and attached as Annex K.
- (ii) UNDP should be prepared to consider regional follow-up support beyond 1991, probably involving the continued services of a CTA and central core staff (see recommendation (iii) below).

105. As regards project contents, the following recommendations are submitted:

- (iii) In the remaining years of the project particular attention should be given to issues calling for follow-up action after 1991; the nature of

this follow-up action, including priorities and the form and level of continued UNDP support, should be considered in the course of 1991 by a round-table discussion involving the principal national counterpart institutions and potential outside contributors (IGOs, NGOs, bilateral programmes, multilateral funding agencies);

- (iv) In this perspective, priority should be given to the interface natural/human environment, and particularly to the role and integration of the cultural patrimony in urban development; a municipal and local government focus will be important;
- (v) Another priority area is project development and pre-investment, ranging from economic planning, financial engineering and management; it is suggested that a task force develop suitable economic models encompassing cultural values, possibly drawing upon the considerable experience with economic modelling and valuation relating to the natural environment;
- (vi) A third general priority area relates to documentation and information systems required to sustain networking arrangements among national and sub-regional institutions;
- (vii) The project should also attempt to address some specific new topics, among

them rescue archaeology, industrial and underwater archaeology; the preservation of film archives and vulnerable materials such as paper; other areas in which continuing action is required are identified in the previous sections of this report, and especially in Part IV;

105. As regards the modus operandi, it is suggested that:

- (viii) Continued emphasis be placed on human resource development, including the training of intermediate technicians; in that connexion, the project should concentrate on the training of trainers, curriculum development and teaching materials, leaving line training functions increasingly to national or sub-regional institutions; the project should also ensure that training courses, even if organized by national institutions, continue to include participants and resource persons from other countries of the region;
- (ix) The project should continue to operate in a decentralized manner, relying upon (and whenever necessary building up) national and interregional institutions operating as networks, with a pattern of specialized centres providing support in particular areas; this should evidently not rule out co-operation with institutions outside the region; it is important, however, that national institutions and networks operate with increased

autonomy; the project should propose a realistic time table to that effect;

- (x) The project should continue and intensify its collaboration with IGOs (within and outside the UN family) and NGOs, involving them in specific operations (e.g. training); in this perspective, the project should take an active part in the World Cultural Development Decade sponsored by UNESCO;
- (xi) The project should publish a bi-monthly bulletin covering not only its own, but also other cultural and cultural preservation activities in the region;
- (xii) The project should retain its regional focus; however, links with other regions should be intensified in terms of:
  - involvement in operational activities (training, research) of countries with a related cultural matrix (Lusophone Africa; Portugal, Spain, etc.);
  - joint research, colloquia and specialized training where the subject-matter requires a trans-regional approach (e.g. adobe);



- use of the regional project and national activities as models for cultural preservation projects in other regions;
- encouraging the use of experts and expertise from the region in technical co-operation with other parts of the world.